

CONFIRMED MINUTES

AUGUST BOARD MEETING

At the **December Board meeting** on **8 Dec 2021** these minutes were **confirmed as presented**.

Name:	The Management Agency National American Foulbrood Pest Management Plan
Date:	Thursday, 12 August 2021
Time:	9:00 am to 4:00 pm
Location:	Board Room, Level 6 Harbour Tower, 2 Hunter Street, Wellington
Board Members:	Mr Russell Marsh (Chair), Dennis Crowley, Gabriel Torres, Hayley Praghert, John Walsh, Mark Dingle, Murray Lewis, Val Graham, Jason Ward
Attendees:	Clifton King, Mike Harre

1. Board Only Session

1.1 Board Only Session

2. AFB PMP Review

2.1 Learnings from the development of the original AFB PMP

Nick Wallingford briefed the Board on his experience developing the proposal for the National American Foulbrood Pest Management Plan and consulting with beekeepers on that proposal.

He emphasised the importance of getting stakeholders buy-in to support the proposal and the importance of displaying AFB elimination best practice to "convince beekeepers to do the best for themselves".

He also highlighted that the Management Agency needs to continue communicating with beekeepers in between consultation rounds to ensure that they are engaged and informed.



Plan order communications requirement

Implement regular communications to keep beekeepers informed of progress in between consultation rounds.

Due Date: 27 Aug 2021

Owner: Clifton King



NZ Beekeeping Inc invitation to Board meeting

Invite NZ Beekeeping Inc to present via Zoom any concerns they may have regarding the review of the plan order to the next Board meeting

Due Date: 30 Sep 2021

Owner: Mr Russell Marsh

2.2 AFB PMP Review Project Plan

Clifton presented the amended project brief and stakeholder engagement plan for approval.

The Board noted that communicating with beekeepers in between consultation rounds was not included in the plans and that this needs to be addressed. Regular communications should advise beekeepers of:

- What beekeepers said in their submissions
- Progress
- Upcoming consultation rounds
- Key messages

The website also needs an FAQ section to inform/answer beekeeper questions on the consultation process.



Additional beekeeper communication requirements

Clifton to revise project brief and budget to include requirement to communicate with beekeepers in between consultation rounds.

Due Date: 10 Sep 2021

Owner: Clifton King



Update board minutes on website

Clifton to ensure confirmed minutes from previous Board meetings posted on website

Due Date: 27 Aug 2021

Owner: Clifton King

2.3 Analysis of submissions

Jan presented the preliminary and incomplete analysis of submissions to the Board. She advised that the analysis of submissions was very time consuming as:

- beekeepers were asked a variety of open ended questions
- beekeepers had made submissions on a wide variety of topics.

The Board noted the preliminary analysis of submissions and that they look forward to considering the final analysis of submissions.

2.4 Response to submissions discussion paper

Clifton presented a discussion paper to the Board to inform preparations for the second round of consultation.

The Board noted that the guidance provided to the National Compliance Manager was interim - and would be revisited once the final analysis of submissions was available for their consideration.

Interim guidance provided by the Board is listed as follows. The Management Agency should:

1. Consult with beekeepers on the potential use of infringement fines for non-compliance with plan rules.
2. Recommend to beekeepers that no changes to 'c25 Beehives posing risk' is required
3. Consult with beekeepers on the inclusion of 's114 General powers' to enable Management Agency to take immediate actions to prevent the spread of AFB
4. Recommend to beekeepers that industry best practice standards are a more appropriate mechanism for addressing overcrowding and boundary stacking issues

5. Recommend to beekeepers that focus on ensuring that beekeepers eliminate AFB as agreed in their DECA is a more effective mechanism for preventing the spread of AFB than imposing movement controls on the wider beekeeping community.
6. Recommend to beekeepers that the current legal requirement to complete AFB recognition course training to apply for a DECA is sufficient.
7. Recommend to beekeepers that the cost of attending AFB recognition course should continue to be funded by course participants and not by levy payers
8. Consult with beekeepers on introducing a requirement to complete online AFB refreshers every 2 years to retain a DECA
9. Recommend to beekeepers that the plan order should not be amended to include compensation as this would represent poor use of levy payer funds
10. Recommend to beekeepers that the inclusion of 's115 Use of dogs and devices' would future proof the pest management plan should the effectiveness of dogs for the detect of AFB be scientifically proven
11. Recommend to beekeepers that sales of beekeeping equipment should not be regulated as it would be too difficult to police, and that beehives are purchased for reasons other than beekeeping
12. Recommend to beekeepers that the current plan rules preventing the exposure of beehives and equipment known or suspected to be associated with cases of AFB are sufficient, and that beekeeping practices such as exposing wets to be robbed are more appropriately addressed through best practice guidelines.
13. Recommend a new plan rule to beekeepers requiring diagnostic laboratories to provide all AFB test results to the Management Agency, as already occurs for the Bovine TB National Pest Management Plan
14. Advise beekeepers that the beekeeping industry decided not to initiate the development of National Pest Management Plan for the control of *Varroa* in the 2000s, and there is currently not sufficient industry support to justify the effort to develop a new national pest management plan for *Varroa*.
15. Advise beekeepers that education not additional regulations are the most appropriate mechanism for increasing the frequency of AFB inspections by beekeepers.
16. Advise beekeepers that the destruction of AFB beehives is and should continue to be the responsibility of beekeepers.

The Board noted that some submitters appeared to be confused about the implementation of the operational plan and that subsequent consultation rounds provide an opportunity to address this. Key topic areas to address include:

- The current approach to compliance and enforcement
- The current approach to AFB training
- The current requirements to enter into a DECA with the Management Agency

The Board noted that the Biosecurity Act 1993 defines a person as "includes the Crown, a corporation sole, a body of persons (whether corporate or unincorporate)" and therefore the drafting of the 'Certificate of Inspection Exemption' section of the plan order applies equally to corporate beekeepers as to sole traders. However, it may be beneficial to make minor amendments to clarify the training requirements for corporations that apply for a DECA.

The Board noted that many submissions highlighted the need for additional research into new AFB inspection and elimination methods, and the Management Agency should consult with beekeepers over its future role with respect to AFB research.

The Board noted the requirement to improve the communication of the pest management plans elimination goals so that beekeepers have a realistic understanding of the timeframes required to eliminate AFB. The plans current primary objective of a 5% reduction in the incidence of AFB requires 20 years to reduce the annual AFB incidence from 0.31% of colonies to 0.11%.

The Board discussed the opportunities to accelerate the rate of reduction in the annual incidence of AFB and noted that this is dependent on the proportion of beekeeping that are complying with their DECAs and plan rules, and the challenges of increasing the proportion of beekeepers that are compliant. The Board noted that education, and compliance and enforcement are the two primary tools available to the Management Agency to increase compliance. They noted a need to extend the current approach to education to include more cases studies that provide insights on how to integrate AFB elimination into beekeeping operations and to highlight the benefits and consequences of adopting effective and ineffective AFB elimination practices.

The Board discussed submissions requesting improved access to AFB elimination information and training. They noted that the AFB website required an upgrade to make it easier for beekeepers to find key information, and that the training programme also required updating. The Board noted that these changes should be progressed this financial year as they did not need to wait for completion of consultation on the plan order.

The Board discussed submissions stating that beekeepers should have to complete regular refresher training to retain a DECA. The Board requested that this potential requirement should be included in the second round of consultation. The Board noted that creating an online AFB Refresher training module would make it much easier for beekeepers to meet the potential refresher training requirement. A decision to develop an online training module should be deferred until the completion of all 3 rounds of consultation.

The Board confirmed the importance of protecting beekeepers private and confidential information to ensure that beekeepers continued to have confidence to supply the information, particularly apiary and AFB notification information to the Management Agency.

The Board noted that a small number of submissions had provided feedback on who should be the Management Agency and the further consultation on this matter is planned for the 2nd and 3rd rounds of consultation.



Update AFB website and training materials

Val to sponsor a project to upgrade the AFB website and AFB Recognition Course

Decision Date: 12 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

3. Operational Plan

3.1 Operational Plan amendments

Clifton present an amended operational plan to the Board for approval



Operational plan amendments

The Board approved submission of the amended operational plan to the Minister

Decision Date: 12 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

4. Minutes and Actions

4.1 Confirm Minutes

May Board Meeting 21 May 2021, the minutes were confirmed with the following changes:
Jason Ward and Clifton King attended via Zoom



Approve minutes of May Board meeting

Approved subject to adding that Jason Ward and Clifton King attended via Zoom

Decision Date: 12 Aug 2021
Mover: Gabriel Torres
Seconder: Jason Ward
Outcome: Approved

4.2 Action List

Due Date	Action Title	Owner
26 Mar 2021	Advise training organisation CEOs of NZ's beekeeping laws Status: Not Started	Clifton King
14 May 2021	Brief Minister Status: Completed on 16 Jul 2021	Clifton King
21 May 2021	Mike to seek legal advise of the applicability of s53 of the Bios... Status: In Progress	Mike Harre
4 Jun 2021	Update PowerPoint presentation Status: Completed on 16 Jun 2021	Clifton King
4 Jun 2021	Marco to provide costed proposal for annual AP2 training for Clif... Status: Completed on 2 Jun 2021	Marco Gonzalez
11 Jun 2021	Clifton to request MPI to advise of any AFB PMP issues the Minist... Status: Completed on 20 Aug 2021	Clifton King
6 Aug 2021	Board Calendar Status: Not Started	Clifton King
6 Aug 2021	OIA Procedures Status: Completed on 7 Aug 2021	Clifton King
6 Aug 2021	Amend Project Plan and Stakeholder Engagement Plan Status: Completed on 7 Aug 2021	Clifton King
6 Aug 2021	Beekeeper and Colony Statistics Status: Completed on 7 Aug 2021	Clifton King
6 Aug 2021	Training Videos Status: In Progress	Janette Gwilliam

4.3 Interests Register

The Board confirmed that Russell Marsh and Dennis Crowley are the only two ApiNZ members on the Management Agency Board.

5. Management Reports

5.1 National Compliance Manager Report

Clifton presented the National Compliance Managers report to the Board.

Hayley Praghert withdrew from the discussion on the MPI licence to use HiveHub data to manage a potential conflict of interest.

The Board discussed the challenges agreeing a contract price for licencing the use of data to MPI for biosecurity purposes. The Board confirmed that the cost of maintaining the information should be the basis for price negotiations not the cost of transferring the information to MPI.



Arrange for Management Agency accountant to prepare cost of maint...

Arrange for Management Agency accountant to prepare cost of maintaining HiveHub information to be supplied to MPI.

Due Date: 20 Aug 2021
Owner: Clifton King

5.2 Finance Reports

Clifton presented the unaudited accounts for 2020/21 to the Board and revised forecasts for 2021/22 and 2022/23.



Note unaudited accounts for 2020/21

The Board noted the unaudited accounts for 2020/21 included a surplus of \$326,506 due to financial assumptions made in January 2019 that did not eventuate.

The Board noted the financial impact of the HiveHub project which had both reduced and delayed operational expenditure that was planned for 2020/21.

The Board also noted that the value of Non Current Assets on the balance sheet had grown by \$673,768, primarily as a consequence of capital expenditure on the HiveHub project. The combined total of capital and operational expenditure for 2020/21 resulted in the Management Agency spending \$347,263 more than the revenue received.

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021
Outcome: Approved



Note 2021/22 budget forecast

The Board noted that \$198,000 of expenditure for 2021/22 had yet to be allocated, and that the budget was subject to significant uncertainties including: revenue from the MPI data licence, and a possible increase in the level of bad debts.

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021
Outcome: Approved



Proposed 2022/23 budget

The Board considered that the proposed budget for 2022/23 was too optimistic as it did not make sufficient allowances for:

- Decreases in levy revenue associated with further reductions in colony numbers
- Increasing provision for bad debts
- Uncertainty over MPI contract

The Board requested the 2022/23 budget be amended to address this.

The Board noted that the levy order requires consultation on the budget every year.

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021
Outcome: Not Approved



Amend 2022/23 budget

Clifton to amend proposed 2022/23 and submit to Board for approval.

Due Date: 3 Sep 2021
Owner: Clifton King

The Board noted the June 2021 year to date expenditure

5.3 Draft OIA Policy

Clifton presented the draft Official Information Act Request Policy to the Board



Submit draft OIA policy to Office of the Ombudsman

The Board approved the submission of the draft OIA policy to the Office of the Ombudsman for review.

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

5.4 HiveHub Terms of Use

Karin Kos joined the Board meeting for this item.

Clifton presented legal advice on the mail out of the April and October Beekeeper Magazine to all registered beekeepers, including recommending that the Management Agency take additional steps to ensure that beekeepers are aware of the Hive Hub Privacy Statement and their ability to 'opt out' of receiving the magazine.

The Board noted that the Beekeeper Magazine was an important communication channel for AFB elimination information.



Beekeeper Magazine communications

The Board agreed that the Management Agency will send out communications to beekeepers advising them of their ability to 'opt out' of receiving the April and October Beekeeper Magazines

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

5.5 Operations Manager Report

Marco and Dwayne presented the Operations Manager report to the Board.

The Board made enquiries about how the inspection programme was organised including the number and location of AP2s, and sought greater visibility of inspection programme progress throughout the year. The Board was informed that:

- The Management Agency attempts to ensure that contract sufficient AP2s to provide inspection capability and capacity throughout the country. The goal is to contract sufficient AP2s to allocate apiaries for inspection that are no more than 50kms from each AP2s home.
- AP2 capacity for each region is assessed each autumn and regions without sufficient capacity are included in the recruitment advertisement in the April Beekeeper Magazine each year.
- The Management Agency receives a good number applicants in response to its advert each year. However certain regions have proved difficult to recruit for, particularly the Waikato and Bay of Plenty.
- HiveHub provides a more useful reporting system for monitoring inspection programme progress than was provided by the Apiary Database. Marco and Dwayne have access to the low level operational reports and maps required to manage the inspection programme on a day to day basis, but further work is required to develop reports and maps that will be of more strategic value for Board reporting.

6. AFB Research

6.1 Clean Hive Project Request

The Board considered the Hive Projects request for request for support. The Board confirmed Management Agency commitment to supporting research projects that may provide enhanced tools and techniques that may enhance the elimination of AFB. Beekeepers that participate in research projects, such as the Clean Hive project should do on the basis that:

- They understand that their involvement in the project is on a voluntary basis only.
- They have been provided with sufficient information to enable them to provide their informed consent to participate in the project.



Response to Clean Hive Project Request

Clifton and Hayley to draft response to Clean Hive Project for approval by Russell.

Due Date: 20 Aug 2021

Owner: Clifton King

7. Matters for Discussion

7.1 Health and Safety Report

Clifton presented the Health and Safety Report to the Board.



Note Health Safety Report August 2021

The Board noted the Health and Safety Report August 2021.

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

7.2 Training Report

Janette presented the Training Report and a costed plan to update the training videos to the Board.

The Board considered the plan to update the training videos in light of earlier conversations about the need to revise the training programme and website, and whether this would result in a requirements for further changes to the videos. The Board confirmed that the current training videos were now dated and that risk further changes would be required to the videos was small. Hence the production of new AFB videos should not be held up by the project update the website and training materials.



Approval of plan to update the AFB training vidoes

The Board approved the plan to update the AFB videos

Decision Date: 13 Aug 2021

Outcome: Approved

7.3 Complaints Report

Clifton presented the Complaints report to the Board.

8. Other Business

8.1 Other Business

The Board discussed the Board calendar and decided that there should be a 1 day Board meeting in October and December. In addition a Zoom call would be required for final consideration of the response to submissions.



Doodle Poll for Board meetings

Clifton to send out Doodle Poll to Board to confirm timing of October and December Board meetings.

Due Date: 3 Sep 2021

Owner: Clifton King

9. Close Meeting

9.1 Close the meeting

Next meeting: No date for the next meeting has been set.

Signature:_____

Date:_____